For Internal Use Only



BALTIMORE CITY COUNCIL HEALTH, WORKFORCE AND TECHNOLOGY COMMITTEE

Mission Statement

On behalf of the Citizens of Baltimore City, the mission of the Health, Environment, and Technology (HET) Committee is to study, review, and recommend policies to improve overall public health and welfare, achieve environmental justice and sustainability, and promote the adoption of, and equitable access to, technology to better meet the needs of all City residents.

The Honorable Danielle McCray Chair

PUBLIC HEARING

Wednesday, NOVEMBER 8, 2023 10:00 AM

COUNCIL CHAMBERS

Council Resolution 22-0136R

Informational Hearing - Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program

CITY COUNCIL COMMITTEES

ECONOMIC AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT (ECD)

Sharon Green Middleton, Chair John Bullock – Vice Chair Mark Conway Ryan Dorsey Antonio Glover Odette Ramos Robert Stokes *Staff: Anthony Leva (410-396-1091)*

WAYS AND MEANS (W&M)

Eric Costello, Chair Kristerfer Burnett Ryan Dorsey Danielle McCray Sharon Green Middleton Isaac "Yitzy" Schleifer Robert Stokes *Staff: Marguerite Currin (443-984-3485)*

PUBLIC SAFETY AND GOVERNMENT

OPERATIONS (SGO) Mark Conway – Chair Kristerfer Burnett Zeke Cohen Erick Costello Antonio Glover Phylicia Porter Odette Ramos Staff: Anthony Leva (410-396-1091)

FINANCE AND PERFORMANCE (FP)

John Bullock, Chair Eric Costello, Vice Chair Isaac "Yitzy" Schleifer Danielle McCray Phylicia Porter Staff: Marguerite Currin (443-984-3485)

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (COW)

President Nick Mosby, Chair All City Council Members *Staff: Larry Greene (410-396-7215)*

EDUCATION, WORKFORCE, AND YOUTH (EWY)

Robert Stokes – Chair John Bullock Zeke Cohen Antonio Glover Sharon Green Middleton Phylicia Porter James Torrence *Staff: Deontre Hayes (410-396-1260)*

HEALTH, ENVIRONMENT, AND TECHNOLOGY

(HET) Danielle McCray – Chair John Bullock Mark Conway Ryan Dorsey Phylicia Porter James Torrence Isaac "Yitzy" Schleifer Staff: Deontre Hayes (410-396-1260)

RULES AND LEGISLATIVE OVERSIGHT

(OVERSIGHT) Isaac "Yitzy" Schleifer, Chair Kristerfer Burnett Mark Conway Eric Costello Sharon Green Middleton Odette Ramos James Torrence Staff: Richard Krummerich (410-396-1266)

LEGISLATIVE INVESTIGATIONS (LI)

Eric Costello, Chair Sharon Green Middleton, Vice Chair Isaac "Yitzy" Schleifer Robert Stokes Danielle McCray Staff: Marguerite Currin (443-984-3485)

Effective: 08/21/23 Revised: 10/03/23



OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES LARRY E. GREENE, Director 415 City Hall, 100 N. Holliday Street Baltimore, Maryland 21202

410-396-7215 / Fax: 410-545-7598 email: larry.greene@baltimorecity.gov

BILL SYNOPSIS

Committee: Health, Environment, and Technology

City Council Resolution: 22-0136R

Informational Hearing - Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program

Sponsor:Councilmember RamosIntroduced:September 9, 2022

Purpose:

For the purpose of inviting the City Solicitor and representatives from the Department of Finance, the Mayor's Office of Information Technology, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, and the Office of Equity and Civil Rights to discuss the status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program, including obstacles, solutions, and a timeline for implementation.

Effective: The 30th day after the date it is enacted

Agency Reports

Baltimore Law Department	Favorable
Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs	Favorable
Baltimore City Office of Information and Technology	Defers to MOCFS
Mayor's Office of Children and Family Success	None as of writing
Baltimore Department of Finance	Favorable
Office of Equity and Civil Rights	None as of writing

Analysis

Current Law

Section 38-1. Definitions. (A) "Baltimore City ID Card"; "Municipal Identity Card". "Baltimore City ID Card" or "Municipal Identity Card" refers to an identification card issued by the City of Baltimore under this subtitle. (B) MOIT. "MOIT" stands for the Mayor's Office of Information Technology.

Background

This bill's primary objective is to convene discussions involving key city officials and departments, including the City Solicitor, Department of Finance, Mayor's Office of Information Technology, Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, and the Office of Equity and Civil Rights. The purpose of these discussions is to assess the current status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program, addressing challenges, proposing solutions, and establishing a timeline for its implementation.

The background of this bill is rooted in the recognition that many residents in Baltimore City face barriers in obtaining government-issued identification cards, which are essential for full participation in the city's diverse society. The lack of accessible identification leaves various groups, such as immigrants, individuals experiencing homelessness, transgender individuals, senior citizens, youth, and formerly incarcerated people, without the means to access vital services and opportunities.

Despite the passage of Article 1, Subtitle 38 of the City Code in 2016, which authorized the creation of a municipal identification card program, limited progress has been made in implementing this program. The bill seeks to address this lapse and aims to ensure that the identification card program becomes a reality, thereby reducing discrimination and enhancing access to essential services for vulnerable groups in Baltimore City.

Additional Information

Fiscal Note: Not Available

Information Source(s): Reporting Agencies Reports

Peontre Hayes

Analysis by:

Deontre Hayes

Direct Inquiries to: (410) 396-1260

Page 2 of 3

Analysis Date: November 6, 2023

HEALTH, ENVIRONMENT, AND TECHNOLOGY COMMITTEE

AGENCY REPORTS

SEE ATTACHED

F R O M	NAME & TITLE	Todd Carter Odd U. Carter Chief Information Officer	CITY of	AF OF A		
	AGENCY NAME & ADDRESS	Baltimore City Office of Information & Technology 401 E. Fayette Street, 3rd floor	BALTIMORE			
	SUBJECT	City Council Bill 22-0136R– Informational Hearing – Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program	ΜΕΜΟ	1707 CRARE		

April 3, 2023

TO: The Honorable President and Members of the City Council Room 400 City Hall c/o Natawna Austin, Executive Secretary

The Baltimore City Office of Information and Technology (BCIT) has completed its review of Council Bill 22-0136R. The purpose of this bill is to invite the City Solicitor and representatives from the Department of Finance, the Baltimore City Office of Information & Technology, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, and the Office of Equity and Civil Rights to discuss the status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program, including obstacles, solutions, and a timeline for implementation.

BCIT defers to the Mayor's Office of Children and Family Success and the Digital Services Team, as they are leading the implementation of the Municipal ID program as it relates to Council Bill 22-0136R. BCIT is serving in a supportive role to the program. We look forward to attending and participating in the upcoming hearing.

If you have any questions, please contact Leyla Layman, Chief of Staff, at (443) 202-4511.

 Ms. Nina Themelis, Interim Director, Mayor's Office of Government Relations Dr. Debra Y. Brooks, Executive Director, Mayor's Office of Children and Family Success
 Mr. Justin Elsasz, Chief Data Office, Office of the Baltimore City Administrator Mx. Shelby Switzer, Director, Digital Services Team
 Ms. Simone Johnson, Deputy City Administrator, Office of the Baltimore City Administrator



February 17, 2023

The Honorable President and Members of the City Council City Hall, Room 400

The Department of Finance is herein reporting on City Council Bill 22-0136R, Informational Hearing – Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program, the purpose of which is to have various agencies discuss the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program.

In 2016, the City enacted Ordinance 16-586, which established the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program. The Mayor's Office of Information Technology, now Baltimore City Office of Information and Technology, is designated as the agency to administer the Program. The Program is intended to provide identification to City residents who are unable to obtain identification for various reasons, including obtaining identification that reflects a resident's gender identity, and requires it to be accepted by City agencies as valid proof of identity and residency. The Center for Popular Democracy states that municipal identification programs are useful for residents who are undocumented immigrants, homeless, transgender, or formerly incarcerated.

Municipalities across the country have implemented municipal identification programs, including New York City, San Francisco, Chicago, Philadelphia, and New Haven, Connecticut. These programs have provided identification to residents, including residents as young as 10, that can be used as a valid form of identification at health clinics and libraries, in interactions with police, to open checking accounts, and enroll in government services and local schools. Budgets for these programs range from over \$16 million in New York City to \$643,645 in Chicago to approximately \$338,000 in Philadelphia, including various levels of staffing. One concern when implementing a municipal identification program is the protection of data collected through the program, specifically for undocumented immigrants. In 2022, Detroit suspended the Detroit ID program over concerns that the program vendor may have leaked data, which was then accessible by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.

The Department of Finance will attend the hearing for this Resolution and respond to any fiscal inquiries.

cc: Michael Moiseyev Nina Themelis

CITY OF BALTIMORE

BRANDON M. SCOTT Mayor



DEPARTMENT OF LAW JAMES L. SHEA, CITY SOLICITOR 100 N. HOLLIDAY STREET SUITE 101, CITY HALL BALTIMORE, MD 21202

September 23, 2022

The Honorable President and Members of the Baltimore City Council Attn: Executive Secretary Room 409, City Hall 100 N. Holliday Street Baltimore, Maryland 21202

Re: City Council Bill 22-0136R – Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program

Dear President and City Council Members:

The Law Department has reviewed City Council Bill 22-0136R for form and legal sufficiency. This resolution calls on representatives from several City agencies to discuss the Municipal Identification Card Program.

A resolution is an appropriate way for the City Council of Baltimore to express its views on a particular matter. *See, e.g., Inlet Assocs. v. Assateague House Condominium,* 313 Md. 413, 428 (1988). Therefore, the Law Department approves this Resolution for form and legal sufficiency.

Very truly yours,

Hilary Ruley Chief Solicitor

cc: James L. Shea, City Solicitor
 Nina Themelis, Mayor's Office of Government Relations
 Elena DiPietro, Chief Solicitor, General Counsel Division
 Ashlea Brown, Chief Solicitor
 Jeffery Hochstetler, Chief Solicitor
 D'ereka Bolden, Assistant Solicitor
 Michelle Toth, Special Assistant Solicitor

January 24, 2023



To the Honorable City Council President, Nick Mosby and Members of the Baltimore City Council City Hall, Room 400

Re: 22-0136R-Informational Hearing - Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program

The Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (MIMA) is herein reporting on City Council Bill 22-0136R-Informational Hearing - Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program.

The Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs (MIMA) supports the implementation of a Municipal Identification Card for vulnerable populations facing obstacles to obtaining secure and recognizable identification due to immigrant status, unstable housing, gender identity, and other barriers.

In 2018, MIMA was invited to participate in program design sessions led by the Mayor's Office and Government Relations and Baltimore City Information Technology (formerly known as the Mayor's Office of Information Technology). During these sessions, MIMA provided the following recommendations to ensure a successful implementation process that was inclusive of immigrant communities:

- Assess demand for the card to make it widely appealing. Conduct listening tours and focus group sessions in multiple languages to ensure that those who most stand to benefit from the ID are involved in the program from the beginning. The sessions would also help determine how many people need a Municipal ID.
- Confidentiality and Security. Ensuring that required information is kept confidential is critical for vulnerable populations such as undocumented immigrants. Based on best practices, supporting documents are never stored to protect the applicant's application. In addition, the program should not collect information such as immigrant status, country of origin, or social security number, as these can serve as an identifier for a person without immigrant status.
- Messaging and Communications. Messaging about the program should focus on the needs of underserved vulnerable communities who do not have access to identification. Any messaging should avoid promoting the program solely for undocumented individuals. Without the proper protections, the program can become a database subject to Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) requests.
- Language Access: The program must have resources to assist Limited English Proficient (LEP) residents. To that end, program and marketing materials should be translated into the city's core languages. In addition, staff should be trained on language access, cultural sensitivity, and ways to assist (LEP) residents.

MIMA is committed to supporting the implementation of a Municipal ID program for vulnerable populations. For this work, MIMA can facilitate immigrant community engagement, participate in program design meetings, help with multilingual messaging and communication, provide language access resources, and develop strategies to enhance trust in the program. We look forward to attending the hearing and answering any questions the Council may have.

Sincerely,

Catalina Rodriguez Lima Director <u>Catalina.rodriguez-lima@baltimorecity.gov</u> 410-818-6193 Masuma Islam Lonczak Deputy Director <u>masuma.lonczak@baltimorecity.gov</u> 410-382-7362.

CITY OF BALTIMORE COUNCIL BILL 22-0136R (First Reader)

Introduced by: Councilmember Ramos Introduced and read first time: September 19, 2022 Assigned to: Health, Environment, and Technology Committee REFERRED TO THE FOLLOWING AGENCIES: City Solicitor, Department of Finance, Office of Information Technology, Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, Office of Equity and Civil Rights

A RESOLUTION ENTITLED

1 A COUNCIL RESOLUTION concerning

2
3

Informational Hearing – Status of the Baltimore City Municipal Identification Card Program

FOR the purpose of inviting the City Solicitor and representatives from the Department of
Finance, the Mayor's Office of Information Technology, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant
Affairs, and the Office of Equity and Civil Rights to discuss the status of the Baltimore City
Municipal Identification Card Program, including obstacles, solutions, and a timeline for
implementation.

Many residents of Baltimore City are unable to obtain government-issued identification
 cards, which are essential to fully participate in the City's diverse society. Although the City
 offers an array of cultural, educational, and civic opportunities meant to be accessible to all
 members of our community, this barrier leaves thousands of individuals – including immigrants,
 those experiencing homelessness, transgender individuals, senior citizens, youth, and formerly
 incarcerated people – without access to these necessary services.

Though the noted groups of individuals face unique obstacles in acquiring government-issued 15 identification - including language and transportation barriers among undocumented residents, 16 17 challenges in modifying gender information for transgender and gender non-conforming residents, and transient or non-existent residency requirements for those experiencing 18 homelessness - they collectively face stigma and burdensome administrative policies for 19 obtaining necessary documents. This increases the likelihood these individuals will experience 20 discrimination in seeking employment or housing or otherwise participating in cultural or civic 21 life. 22

Whereas Article 1, Subtitle 38 {"Municipal Identification"} of the City Code (Ordinance
16-586) was passed in 2016, no meaningful action has been taken to implement a Citywide
municipal identification card program.

Council Bill 22-0136R

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF BALTIMORE, That the
 Baltimore Council invites the City Solicitor and representatives from the Department of Finance,
 the Mayor's Office of Information Technology, the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, and the
 Office of Equity and Civil Rights to discuss the status of the Baltimore City Municipal
 Identification Card Program, including obstacles, solutions, and a timeline for implementation.

AND BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, That a copy of this resolution will be sent to the City
 Solicitor, the Director of the Department of Finance, the Chief Digital Officer of the Mayor's
 Office of Information Technology, the Director of the Mayor's Office of Immigrant Affairs, the
 Chief Equity Officer of the Office of Equity and Civil Rights, and the Mayor's legislative liaison

10 to the City Council.