

---

**Minutes  
Biennial Audits Oversight Commission**

**Wednesday, December 18, 2019  
5:05 PM thru 7:40 PM**

**Commission Members**

**In Attendance**

Eric T. Costello, Chairman  
Joan Pratt, Comptroller  
Bill Henry, Councilmember  
Brandon Scott, City Council President  
Henry Raymond, Director of Finance  
Leon Pinkett, Councilmember  
Isabel Cumming, Inspector General

**Speakers**

Josh Pasch, Department of Audits

**Agency Representatives**

Kim Clark, BDC  
Todd Carter, BCIT  
John Chalmers, DPW  
ChiChi Nyagah-Nash, DGS  
Ford Niles, Fire Department  
John Turner, Human Services  
Michael Braverman, Housing & Comm. Develop.

1. Chairman Costello began the meeting by introducing commission members. Thereafter a motion was made to vote on the minutes from the September 25, 2019 meeting; motioned by Member Pratt, seconded by Member Raymond.
  - Six members -Yea
  - One member – Out of Chambers
  - Minutes Adopted
  - *Voting Sheet on File*
2. Josh Pasch from the Department of Audits gave a PowerPoint Presentation. *A copy is on file.* The first half of the presentation covered the status of the Financial and Performance Audits performed for Fiscal Years 2017 and 2018 for the following agencies (GROUP A): *Note: These audits were conducted during calendar year 2019*
  - Mayor's Office of Human Services
  - Department of Public Works – Bureau of Solid Waste
  - Baltimore City Information Technology
  - Department of Finance
  - Department of General Services
  - Baltimore City Fire Department
  - Department of Housing and Community Development, and
  - The Baltimore Development Corporation

3. Several agency representatives were in attendance to address and give updates to the questions and/or concerns the Commission members asked and/or had regarding agencies' audit findings, recommendations and implementation. Some highlights of discussion were:

- **Baltimore Development Corporation (Kim Clark and Todd Carter)**
  - **Recommendation #2 in Audit Report**
    - *New System Implementation as of 12/31/19*
      - *Is BDC on track?*
      - *Can the Baltimore City Information Technology Office assist BDC with implementing the new system?*
- **Department of Public Works (John Chalmers and Todd Carter)**
  - *Agency representative(s) were asked to give updates on:*
    - *The reported amounts of recycling tonnage collected*
    - *Performance targets for percentage of missed trash and recycling pickups*
    - *What is the action plan for the missed trash and recycling pickups Findings?*
    - *There was also some discussion regarding truck tickets/tonnage tickets*
    - *Can BCIT help DPW establish a process (help with tonnage tickets processes) Requested by Chairman Costello: For DPW and BCIT to meet to discuss this project ASAP*
    - *Rat Burroughs*
      - *Comment: Rat Burroughs – not meeting target is of concern; need to be pro-active instead of reactive*
      - *Detecting and preventing rats – the checklist is not always prepared and/or completed. How was this addressed? Have you put in a request for more funding to address this issue?*
      - *Can you and/or I highly recommend you consider looking into the Innovation Fund?*
    - *Has anyone investigated why the \$5.6 million grant money was not moved since 2017?*
- **Fire Department (Niles Ford)**
  - *Is mowing still a part of the Fire Department's budget?*
  - *Code Enforcement (Renewal Notices and Expired Permits – can you formulize a policy for this?)*
  - *What is Tele-Staff and E-time?*
- **Baltimore City Information Technology Office (Todd Carter)**
  - *BCIT did not respond to their Performance Audits, why?*
    - *Answer: Mainly due to the ransomware attack and lack of communicating with the BCIT Team. Eventually the Office submitted a set of matrixes.*
    - *How many matrixes do you have? Answer: Approximately thirteen (13)*

- *Comment: We do not want agencies changing matrixes, it would set a precedent*
  - *Comment: The Department of Audits can't assist agencies with developing matrixes. It would be a conflict of interest*
  - *Follow-up request from Chairman Costello: Please submit BCIT set of matrixes to Commission.*
  - **Mayor's Office of Human Services (John Turner)**
    - *Eviction Protection Grants and Clients Who Maintain Housing for Six Months or Longer Findings: (Page 12 of Audit)*
      - *Finding and Office Response – Partially Implemented*
        - *Which part of these Findings is not implemented?*
  - **Department of Housing and Community Development (Michael Braverman)**
    - *Comment: Seven of the eight Findings were addressed and/or implemented. Chairman Costello stated, "this is outstanding."*
  - **Department of Finance (Henry Raymond)**
    - *How are targets calculated?*
    - *The Department have a few Findings that are partially implemented, when will the recommendations be fully implemented?*
  - **Department of General Services – NOTE: Per Chairman Costello, "Because DGS Audit Report is not finalized, the Commission will ask them to come back at another time."**
  - **Mayor's Office of Emergency Management (MOEM) – is to attend at a later date**
  - **Testimony from agency representatives was concluded.**
4. Josh Pasch from the Department of Audits gave the second half of the PowerPoint Presentation which focused on proposed performance measures for the agencies that will be audited during calendar year 2020.
  5. The Commission members made comments, made requests and asked Mr. Pasch questions. Some highlights of same were:
    - **Transportation (DOT)**
      - *Why are we proposing to look at two measures that are managed by parking authority functions?*
      - *Does the Parking Authority have an independent audit annually?*  
**Answer: Yes**
    - **Comments/Requests**
      - *Let's have a separate audit for the Parking Authority*
      - *Can you take a look at the Commissioners Crime Plan to see if the proposed performance measures are in line with the Plan?*
      - *Can "Recruitment volume in conjunction with Recruit Stat be a proposed measure?*
      - **Tree Planting**
        - *Would like a total picture of all efforts*
        - *Would like to see a performance measure for tree trimming and stump grinding*
      - **Pool Maintenance, what will be the scope for:**
        - *Maintenance checks*
        - *When pools are to be opened*

- YO Program
  - Would like to see a performance measure for: The total number of participants in the program
  - Is there another measure for the program to show what they are actually doing?
- 6. **Proxy Vote Clarification** – Chairman Costello talked about a written response received from Matthew Stegman, Mayor's Office. *A copy is on file.* Per the response, "The Commission can't have a proxy vote in the absence of a member."
- 7. The Chairman talked about items to be discussed at the next meeting. As follows:
  - DGS and MOEM are to attend meeting
  - Approval of Minutes from previous meeting
  - Discussion of "Follow-up Items"
  - Discuss Revised Performance Measures based on the December 18<sup>th</sup> discussion – **Note: Chairman to meet with Mr. Pasch sometime in January to discuss same.**

Meeting adjourned.

Minutes Approved:

July 8, 2020

- see attached voting record

# BALTIMORE CITY BIENNIAL AUDITS OVERSIGHT COMMISSION VOTING RECORD

APPROVAL OF DECEMBER 18, 2019 MINUTES

DATE: July 8, 2020

MOTION BY: Raymond      SECONDED BY: Pratt

☒ FAVORABLE

☐ FAVORABLE WITH AMENDMENTS

☐ UNFAVORABLE

☐ WITHOUT RECOMMENDATION

NAME	YEAS	NAYS	ABSENT	ABSTAIN
Costello, Eric - Chair	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Raymond, Henry	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Cumming, Isabel	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Pratt, Joan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Scott, Brandon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Pinkett, Leon	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Henry, Bill	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
<b>TOTALS</b>	<u>5</u>	<u>-</u>	<u>2</u>	<u>-</u>

CHAIRPERSON: Eric T. Costello, ETC m.m.c

STAFF PERSON: Marguerite M. Currin,      Initials: m.m.c